

CRITICAL REVIEW FORM: CLINICAL DECISION RULE I

GUIDE		COMMENTS
I	Is this a newly derived instrument? (Level IV) Was validation restricted to the retrospective use of statistical techniques on the original database? If so, this is a Level IV rule and it is not ready for clinical application. Otherwise, if an independent validation study has been performed, the following questions regarding the derivation process are relevant to the appraisal.	
1	Were all important predictors included in the derivation process?	
2	Were all important predictors present in a significant proportion of the study population?	
3	Does the rule make clinical sense?	
II	Has the instrument been validated? (Level II or III) If so, consider the following:	
1	Did validation include prospective studies on several different populations from that used to derive it (II), or was it restricted to a single population (III)?	
III	How well did the validation study meet the following criteria:	
1	Did the patients represent a wide spectrum of severity of disease?	
2	How were the predictors applied?	
3	Was there an explicit and accurate interpretation of the predictor variables and the actual rule without knowledge of the outcome?	

4	For how long patients were followed?	
5	Were outcomes objective?	
6	How powerful is the rule (in terms of sensitivity or relative risks or absolute outcome rates) Ref Online Calculators http://statpages.org/ctab2x2.html http://www.quesgen.com/Calculators/CIforLR/CIforLR.html http://araw.mede.uic.edu/cgi-bin/testcalc.pl	
7	What were <u>the actual outcome rates</u> in the low risk groups in the two studies? Ref: Online Calculator http://statpages.org/confint.html	
IV	Has an impact analysis demonstrated change in clinical behavior or patient outcomes as a result of using the instrument? (Level I) <i>If so, consider the following.</i>	
1	How well did the study guard against bias in terms of differences at the start (concealed randomization, adjustment in analysis) or as the study proceeded (blinding, co-intervention, loss to follow-up)	
2	What was the impact on clinician behavior and patient-important outcomes?	
3	Should I use this rule in my practice?	